

REVIEWS OF FOLKLORE SCHOLARSHIP

William Alexander Clouston (1843–96), Folklorist: Introduction and Bibliography

Gareth Whittaker

Introduction

Richard Dorson counted William Alexander Clouston among the “giants” of nineteenth-century folklore. In *The British Folklorists* (Dorson 1968a, 257), he placed him in his “Great Team” alongside Andrew Lang, George Laurence Gomme, Alfred Nutt, Edwin Sidney Hartland and Edward Clodd. But Clouston never sat easily in such illustrious company, neither in reality nor in Dorson’s mind. [1] He was not a team player. He lived in Glasgow and took little part in the activities of The Folk-Lore Society in which the other team members were such leading lights. He was not an anthropological folklorist and, above all, he did not theorise about folklore nor take part in the controversy over the nature, origin and diffusion of folktales, which was such a conspicuous feature in folklore journals and congresses in the last two decades of the century (Dorson 1968a, 202–265 (esp. 218) and 298–307).

Dorson, at least for a while, thought that Clouston belonged in the “Great Team” because of “his sensitivity to the science of folklore, his command of the vast literature, and his development of the work of the earlier English folklorists” (Dorson 1968a, 258). He praised him for bringing “within the sphere of folklore science two species of oral narratives ..., the romance of the East and the humble jest” (ibid., 263). Dorson also considered that in the chapter divisions of his *Popular Tales and Fictions*, Clouston “was isolating tale-types of the kind assigned regular numbers today in the Aarne-Thompson index of folktales, while in his occasional notes on the smaller elements in the narratives he was isolating motifs which have found their way into Stith Thompson’s *Motif Index of Folk-Literature*” (ibid., 260). Finally, in summing up Clouston’s contribution to folklore studies, Dorson states: “The achievement of William Alexander Clouston in rendering visible the network of popular tales and fictions between Asia and Europe has never received proper due, and that field still today remains largely his own” (ibid., 264).

All that has been published about W. A. Clouston’s life is contained in the entry under his name in *A Supplement to Allibone’s Dictionary* (1891), in the “Obituary” by Sidney Hartland published in *Folk-Lore* in 1897 (Hartland 1897, 94) [2] and in Dorson’s *The British Folklorists* (1968a, 257–65). The *Allibone* entry is as follows:

- b. 1843, at Stromness, Orkney Islands, of an old Norse family, in early life was engaged in commercial pursuits in Glasgow and London, but relinquished these to engage in journalism

and literature; he edited several Scotch provincial newspapers, 1871-79, and is a writer for the Glasgow Herald, Evening Times, &c. He has given particular attention to Oriental fiction and folk-lore, and contributed to Sir R. F. Burton's "Supplemental Arabian Nights" analogues and variants of some of the tales in vols. I-iii (*A Supplement to Allibone's Dictionary* 1891, 349-50).

Hartland's "Obituary" adds only that Clouston died suddenly on 23 October 1896 "at a comparatively early age," that he was "generous in his appreciation of the labours of others," that he "never refused assistance to fellow students," and that "unfortunately, life to him was throughout more or less of a struggle, in which he secured but few of the rewards that wait on worldly success" (Hartland 1897, 94).

Apart from a detailed survey of Clouston's books, the only biographical detail Dorson adds is an illustration of the struggles in his life referred to by Hartland. He quotes from an 1891 letter Clouston wrote to Alfred Nutt, which is attached to a revision copy of Clouston's *On The Magical Elements in Chaucer's Squire's Tale* (1890) in the library of The Folk-Lore Society. Clouston hoped that the Council would publish his revised version that included "considerable alterations and additions, so as to render it specially a book for folk-lore students" (Clouston 1891, letter 11 December) and almost begged for an immediate advance to help him recover from a "household wreck" recently suffered. The Council refused his request, fearing copyright problems with the original publishers—the Chaucer Society (Dorson 1968a, 257-8). This picture of an author struggling to make ends meet is further confirmed in Clouston's letters to William Blackwood and Sons, the publishers of his *Popular Tales and Fictions* (1887), between 1880 and 1894. [3]

The public record adds but little to this bare outline of Clouston's life. He was the fourth of five children of Captain John Clouston, a ship-master from Stenness in Orkney. His mother was from Forfar, Montrose. William Alexander was born in Stromness. His father died when he was ten years old and it was probably then that the family moved to Glasgow where he was to live with his mother and his sisters for the rest of his life. At the age of seventeen, according to the 1861 *Census for Scotland*, Clouston was working as a clerk in marine insurance at that time and he was still described as a mercantile clerk in the 1871 *Census*. He was then twenty-seven years old. In subsequent Censuses (1881 and 1891) he is described as a journalist. He never married. I have not yet been able to discover where or how he died at the age of fifty-three.

From the year 1873 he began publishing books and articles on literary topics and by about 1879, after reading Sir William Jones's translation of the "Hitopadesa," he had formed an interest in European folklore genres such as jests, anecdotes, legends and tales, and in their parallels in Eastern oral tradition and literature (Clouston 1893, 22). He also considered the possibility that the European variants were connected to the Eastern ones by way of diffusion or migration westward (Clouston 1887, vol. 1, xi, 10-11 and 37; 2002, xlv, lii and lxviii). In common with the other members of the "Great Team" he was not a fieldworker. As far as I can tell, he did all his work from the two great libraries in Glasgow—The Mitchell Library, North Street, and the Glasgow University Library—and from contacts with librarians and folklorists elsewhere. While it might not be strictly true, as Hartland claimed in his "Obituary," that he did not

enquire into the origin of the narratives that interested him, it is certainly true that he did not investigate their meaning. He also did not concern himself with their social setting and, above all, he was not interested in the “folk” who performed the folklore items involved, or the group context, or the stylistic niceties of their performance. For him the narrative was all that mattered as he was not a theoretician, but rather a comparativist (Ralston 1887, 388).

In entering upon the field of folklore, Clouston found himself, in 1879—one year after the founding of The Folk-Lore Society—in what Dorson has described as a “whirlpool of activity” in folklore studies and “a brilliant chapter in the history of modern thought” (Dorson 1968a, 202). The story is well known about how Andrew Lang, armed by Edward B. Tylor’s anthropological theories of cultural evolution and survivals, defeated Max Müller’s solar mythology, then turned his attention to the Indo-European diffusionist theories of Theodor Benfey, who was later supported by Emmanuel Cosquin on the Continent and Joseph Jacobs and Moses Gaster in Britain (Dorson 1955).

While Clouston did not participate directly in the debate on theories of diffusion, he was clearly regarded by his contemporaries as being in the camp of Benfey, Cosquin and Jacobs, as his work provided evidence that stories travelled from the East into Europe (Dorson 1968a, 258). Like his counterpart Reinhold Köhler (1830–92) working in his library in Weimar, Germany (Cochiara 1971, index; Dundes 1999, 25–9), Clouston’s annotations, which pointed to story analogues and incidents in out of the way literature, provided a service to other scholars who could make of them what they wished. In his review of *Popular Tales and Fictions* in *The Academy*, W. R. S. Ralston stated that:

Mr. Clouston has not attempted to prove too much. Having traced a story throughout the various forms which it has assumed in diverse lands, and compared its variants, current among unlettered European labourers, with those which are to be found in the works of sages and romancers who wrote ages ago in Asia, he is content to leave the evidence he has collected to appeal to the intelligence of his reader (Ralston 1887, 388).

This was clearly Clouston’s approach throughout his writings—to display parallels, in extended quotations or summaries, and to let the readers draw whatever conclusions they felt were warranted. In this way he brought together a virtually unparalleled corpus of analogues and story and motif comparisons in a manner that was at once both scholarly and entertaining. [4] His books, therefore, are relatively theory-free and this is true also of his minor writings presented in the bibliography that follows this article. I say relatively theory-free because his books and notes, where they were not built around Eastern works such as *The Bakhtyár Nâma* (1883), *The Book of Sindibâd* (1884), and the *Arabian Nights* (1886, 1887), were only selections, and therefore, as Christine Goldberg has pointed out (Goldberg 2002, X), his choice of examples, due to his wide knowledge of Eastern literature, could be said to have been biased in favour of stories that he knew had Eastern, rather than Western, origins. This might also have given the impression, wrongly or rightly, that *all* European folktales were descended from Eastern originals, if only because so many of those that he discussed were indeed so derived.

Criticism of Clouston’s methods was present in his own day and continued into the second half of the last century. Joseph Jacobs stated:

At first sight it seems to argue a wide spread for a story to see it quoted from "Anvari-Suhaili," "Hitopadesa," "Directorium vite humane," "Panchatantra," "Exemplario," "Stephanite I Ichnelate," ... and so on. Mr. Clouston especially is fond of ringing these changes (*Popular Tales, pass.*) ... All these are but one book, and ... they cannot be counted over and over again as proving the popularity of each story (Jacobs 1888, xxxv). [5]

But it is absurd to suggest that Clouston did not know the relations between these books (Clouston 1887, vol. 1, 8, 57 and 263; 1887, vol. 2, 39 and 181–3; 2002, li, lxxx, 115, 288 and 372–3), and there is no evidence that he tried to deceive. More recently, Francis Lee Utley, while referring to *Popular Tales and Fictions* as a pioneer study of tales, talked about Clouston's "folkloristic sins," his "confusion of tale types and motifs," and his "casual methods." The essence of his criticisms seems to be that Clouston "slip(s) from one tale type to another on the wings of a single motif," and that he is not "careful, when pleading genetic relationship between two widely separated parallels, to trace complexes of motifs rather than single motifs, however central they may be to the main story" (Utley 1964, 605; 1976, 170; 1978, 12).

These charges would have more relevance if Clouston had in fact made large genetic claims for the single incident parallels he pointed to, rather than being content to leave that to his readers; or if he was not very much aware, as were most of the "Great Team," long before the type and motif distinctions had been articulated, of what Utley calls "the basic axiom of international folktale science." This, he says, is the proposition "that the tale can be shown to have been diffused and not independently created, because it is complex and coherent enough to make independent origins unlikely" (Utley 1964, 605). Indeed, on the rare occasions when Clouston gestures toward a conclusion based on his parallels, it is to express surprise that anyone might claim that stories with so many striking resemblances were independently conceived. For instance, in a review of E. S. Hartland's *The Science of Fairy Tales* he stated:

But, if it be freely admitted that short and simple tales or jests have been independently conceived or invented ... it is not only far from probable, but almost impossible, that such could also be the case of tales of more complex construction, where the same incidents, and their very sequence, are found preserved among races far apart (Clouston 1891; see also Clouston 1890, 264 and 302 where similar ideas are expressed; also Lang 1893, 415).

Both Dorson in *The British Folklorists* and, more recently, Christine Goldberg in her introduction to her new edition of *Popular Tales and Fictions* (Dorson 1968a, 261–3; Goldberg 2002, XI–XVI) have described and discussed Clouston's folklore-related books. Goldberg, in offering plausible reasons why successors to Clouston's approach are scarce, has described how twentieth-century developments in folktale research became more co-operative and professional subsequent to the publication of Bolte and Polívka's *Anmerkungen* (1913–32), "Folklore Fellows Communications" (1910–), Antti Aarne and Stith Thompson's *The Types of the Folktale* (1961), Stith Thompson's *Motif-Index of Folk Literature* (1955–8), and Kurt Ranke's *Enzyklopädie des Märchens* (1977–). She suggests that Clouston's *Popular Tales and Fictions* complements the modern works in folklore most similar to it—Thompson's *The Folktale* (1946) and Aarne and Thompson's *The Types of the Folktale* (1961). While the latter work has a northern-European and oral bias, Clouston deliberately favoured Asian written sources, although he

often presented contemporary, orally collected material as additional analogues. She concludes:

... the priority of written versus oral tradition was a matter of dispute for a long time. Recently, however, researchers have shown themselves to be willing to try to consider all evidence—written, oral, dramatic and pictorial—of a tale type or of a motif. Furthermore, the recent interest in contemporary folklore has directed attention to the kind of informal jests that were Clouston's forte. For these reasons, *Popular Tales and Fictions* should have more appeal now than it had fifty years ago (Goldberg 2002, XXII).

In addition to her "Introduction," Goldberg also provides a very useful list of notes on "Subsequent Scholarship on Clouston's Tales" (2002, XXVI–XXXI) where she identifies type and motif numbers of the tales and incidents dealt with and indicates starting points to further research. [6]

The section on Clouston in *The British Folklorists* and Goldberg's new edition of *Popular Tales and Fictions* are two important steps toward offering Clouston what Dorson said was his "proper due" (Dorson 1968a, 264). This bibliography is intended as a homage to a neglected writer and a small step in the same direction.

The Bibliography

W. A. Clouston produced seventeen books, the first of which was published in 1873 and the last, at the end of a twenty-one-year period, in 1894. Several of these he had had printed himself, financed by advance subscription from libraries and members of learned bodies such as the Royal Asiatic Society. (See letter from James Robertson [1840–1920] to Duncan Black Macdonald [1863–1943] describing "what Clouston did when he was getting out those books of his"; MS Gen 513/21, Special Collections, University of Glasgow). In the years when he was not busy working on a book, or a major annotation project such as that of the *Canterbury Tales* for the Chaucer Society, or the *Supplemental Arabian Nights* for Sir Richard Burton, he contributed the more than one hundred articles and notes by which he intended to put on record the variants and analogues of well-known tales, jokes, fables and nursery stories that he had found.

My interest in compiling a bibliography of Clouston's work arose from my discovery of how little was known about his folkloric publications. Having scoured reference works such as Poole's Index to Periodical Literature I soon discovered that these were inadequate, and resorted to other means to track down Clouston's published work, such as looking through the indexes of individual volumes of academic periodicals of the late nineteenth century—the time when Clouston was active. A visit to the Mitchell Library in Glasgow turned up a collection, produced by Clouston himself, of many of his folklore-related contributions to a variety of journals and newspapers. These were bound together in three volumes called "*Collectanea*" and were mostly items I had already found, but the collection also included some surprises such as the articles in *Chambers's Encyclopaedia*, an article in the *Westmorland Gazette* and some reviews, apparently in newspapers, that I have not been able to identify.

Surprises also awaited me in the library of The Folklore Society, London. It

was there that I discovered Clouston's letters to Alfred Nutt in the revision copy of Clouston's "On the Magical Elements in *Chaucer's Squire's Tale*." Yet another surprise was to find that, although Orkney-born Clouston had lived almost all his life in Glasgow, he had published an article in *The Orkney Herald* in 1892 that was later read before the Viking Club of which he was a member. For this find I am grateful to Alison Fraser, the Principal Archivist, in 1995, of the Orkney Library, Kirkwall. Other libraries that helped with biographical and bibliographical information are listed in the Acknowledgements.

Arrangement of the Material

Following Gillian Bennett, "Charlotte Sophia Burne, Shropshire Folklorist, First Woman President of the Folklore Society, and First Woman Editor of Folklore, Part 2: Update and Preliminary Bibliography" (*Folklore* 112 [2001]: 101), I make a purely quantitative distinction between "Articles" and "Notes, Comments and Queries." "Articles" have three or more pages, "Notes Comments and Queries" less than three pages. Exception is made where a series of short pieces appears under the same title; this is classed as an "Article".

Within each of the following sections, items are in date order.

Books

- Johnson & Boswell; Rambling Remarks on the Author of "The Rambler" and his Biographer.* By W. A. C. [William Alexander Clouston] Dunfermline (*Beveridge's Dunfermline Bibliography*), 1873. Per *Dictionary of Anonymous and Pseudonymous English Literature*. New and Enlarged Edition. Volume Seven. Index and Second Supplement, 1934; and Volume 3 (1928): 195.
- Sketches on Ruskin & Democracy.* By W. A. C. [W. A. Clouston] Dunfermline, [1875?]. Per *Dictionary of Anonymous and Pseudonymous English Literature*. New and Enlarged Edition. Volume Seven—Index and Second Supplement, 1934. Volume 5 (1929): 289.
- Wisdom and Genius of Dr. Samuel Johnson: Selected from his Prose Writings.* London: James Blackwood and Co., 1875. Reprinted Folcroft, Pa.: Folcroft Library Editions, 1973; Norwood, Pa.: Norwood Editions, 1978.
- Literary Curiosities and Eccentricities: A Book of Anecdotes, Laconic Sayings, and Gems of Thought, in Prose and Verse*, ed. W. A. Clouston. London: Ward, Lock & Tyler, 1875.
- The Book of Scottish Story: Historical, Traditionary, Legendary, Imaginary, and Humorous*, selected and ed. William Alexander Clouston. Edinburgh: The Edinburgh Publishing Company, 1876.
- Wine and Walnuts* (same as *Literary Curiosities and Eccentricities* earlier, different title page). London: Ward, Lock & Tyler, 1876.
- Arabian Poetry for English Readers: Edited with Introduction and Notes.* Glasgow: Privately Printed, 1881. Reprinted London: Darf Publishers Ltd, 1986.
- The Bakhtyār Nāma: A Persian Romance. Edited, with Introduction and Notes.* Glasgow: Privately Printed, 1883.
- Choice Anecdotes and Good Sayings of the Witty & Wise ... in prose and verse.* Edited. London: Ward Lock & Co., 1883.

The Book of Sindibád; or, the Story of the King, his Son, the Damsel, and the Seven Vazirs. From the Persian and Arabic. With Introduction, Notes, and Appendix. Privately Printed, 1884.

Popular Tales and Fictions, their Migrations and Transformations. 2 vols. Edinburgh and London: William Blackwood and Sons, 1887. Reprinted Detroit: Singing Tree Press, 1968. New Edition, ed. and introduction by Christine Goldberg. Santa Barbara, Calif.: ABC-CLIO, 2002.

The Book of Noodles: Stories of Simpletons; or, Fools and their Follies. London: Elliot Stock 1888. Re-issued popular edition, 1903; reprinted Detroit, Mich.: Gale Research Co., 1969.

A Group of Eastern Romances and Stories from the Persian, Tamil, and Urdu. With Introduction, Notes, and Appendix. Privately Printed, 1889. Reprinted Norwood, Pa.: Norwood Editions, 1974; Folcroft, Pa.: Folcroft Library Editions, 1977; Philadelphia, Pa.: R. West, 1978.

Flowers from a Persian Garden, and Other Papers. London: David Nutt, 1890. Reprinted New York: Arno Press, 1977.

Literary Coincidences; A Bookstall Bargain; And Other Papers. Glasgow: Morison Bros, 1892. Re-issued 1901; reprinted Folcroft, Pa.: Folcroft Library Editions, 1973.

Some Persian Tales, from Various Sources. With Introduction, Notes and Appendix. Glasgow: David Bryce and Son, 1892.

Book of Wise Sayings, Selected Largely from Eastern Sources. London: Hutchinson & Co., 1893.

Five Hundred and Eighty Nine Wise Sayings Selected Largely from Eastern Sources. New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1893.

Hieroglyphic Bibles. Their Origin and History. A Hitherto Unwritten Chapter of Bibliography. Glasgow: David Bryce & Son, 1894.

Articles

"Eastern Origin of a Jest of Scogin." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, XI (1879): (19 April) 302, (17 May) 382-3, and (31 May) 426.

"Oriental Sources of some of Chaucer's Tales, 1. The Pardoner's Tale." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, XII (1885): (28 November) 421-2, (26 December) 509-10; 7th series, I (1886): (13 February) 124-6, (6 March) 182-4, and (19 June) 483-486.

"Stories of Noodledom." *The Antiquary* (February 1886): 41-9.

"Shylock and his Predecessors." *The Academy* No. 789 (18 June 1887): 434; and No. 796 (6 August 1887): 89-91.

"Two South Pacific Folk-tales." *Folk-Lore Journal* 5 (1887): 254-7.

"Cumulative Nursery Stories" *Notes and Queries* 7th series, VIII (1889): (26 October) 321-2.

"Cumulative Nursery Stories" *Notes and Queries* 7th series, IX (1890): (1 March) 163, (14 June) 461-2.

"Cumulative Nursery Stories" *Notes and Queries* 7th series, XI (1891): (28 February) 161-2.

"'Uncle Remus' and Some European Popular Tales &c." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, X (1890): (26 July) 61-2, (13 September) 201-2, (4 October) 263-4, (18 October) 301-2, and (8 November) 363-4.

- "Parallel Passages from European and Asiatic Writers." *Living Age* 5th series, LXXII. (October–December 1890): 251–5.
- "Some Asiatic Jest Domiciled in Europe." *Asiatic Quarterly Review* 10 (1890): 372–87.
- "The Story of 'The Frog Prince': Breton Variant, and Some Analogues." *Folk-Lore* 1 (1890): 493–506.
- "A Gorgeous Oriental Manuscript: Asiatic Source of a Passage in the 'Dictees' printed by Caxton." *The Bookworm* 4 (1891): 37–42.
- "How Eastern Books Begin and End." *The Bookworm* 4 (1891): 121–5.
- "'Harry White's Humour.'" *The Bookworm* 4 (1891): 277–80.
- "Sinbad's Voyages: A Whale Mistaken for an Island." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, XI (1891): (13 June) 462–3.
- "Sinbad's Voyages: The Old Man of the Sea." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, XI (1891): (20 June) 482–4.
- "'The Book of Sindibád'." *The Athenaeum* No. 3333 (12 September 1891): 355–6; and No. 3336 (3 October 1891): 451–2.
- "The Baker of Beaulieu. A Highland Version of the Tale of the 'Three Precepts'" (by Alexander MacBain with notes by Clouston). *Folk-Lore* 3 (1892): 182–92.
- "The Three Precepts: a Norse Variant." *Folk-Lore* 3 (1892): 557–8.
- "Some Beautiful Books." *The Bookworm* 5 (1892): 83–5.
- "A Puritan Book Rarity." *The Bookworm* 5 (1892): 145–50.
- "Some Old English Metrical Versions of the Psalms." *The Bookworm* 5 (1892): 303–312 and 361–7.
- "Norse Tales and their Eastern Analogues." *The Orkney Herald* (21 December 1892) 7, (28 December 1892) 7, (4 January 1893) 7, and (11 January 1893) 7.
- "The Works of Sir William Jones. A Protest." *The Bookworm* 6 (1893): 19–22.
- "'Reynard the Fox.'" *The Bookworm* 6 (1893): 209–11.
- "Hieroglyphic Bibles." *The Bookworm* 7 (1894): 169–71.
- "Source of the Persian Tales of 'Les Mille et Un Jours'" *Notes and Queries* 8th series, VII (1895): (26 January) 62–3, (16 February) 123–6, (2 March) 163–4, and (23 March) 222–5.

Annotations

- Appendix on "Sufiism" in *Persian Poetry for English Readers*, by S. Robinson. 643–6. Printed for Private Circulation by Clouston, 1883.
- Additional Analogues of "The Wrights Chaste Wife"*, by Adam Cobsam, ed. F. J. Furnivall for Early English Texts Society, Original Series nos. 12 and 84. 25–39. London: N. Trübner & Co., 1886. Reprinted New York: Greenwood Press, 1969.
- Originals and Analogues of Some of Chaucer's Canterbury Tales*, ed. F. J. Furnivall, E. Brock and W. A. Clouston. 289–559. London: Chaucer Society, 1872–88. Reprinted 1928–37.
- Appendix: "Variants and Analogues of Some of the Tales in the Supplemental Nights." In *Supplemental Nights to the Book of the Thousand Nights and a Night* by Richard F. Burton. vol. 2, 289–383. vol. 3, 551–652. Printed by the Burton Club for Private Subscribers Only, 1886.

- "English Abstract of French Original and Asiatic Versions of the Tale." In *The Tale of Beryn*, ed. F. J. Furnivall and W. G. Stone for the Chaucer Society, Extra Series no. 105. 121–74. London: N. Trübner & Co., 1887.
- "Notes on the Magical Episodes in *Duke Huon of Burdeux*." vol. 2, ed. S. L. Lee for the Early English Text Society. 798–811. London: N. Trübner & Co., 1887.
- "Notes to *The King and his Four Minister*," by Pandit S. M. Natésa Sástrí. Madras: G. W. Taylor, 1889.
- "Notes to *Tales of the Sun or Folklore of Southern India*." Collected by Mrs. Howard Kingscote and Pandit Natésa Sástrí. Notes: 141, 290–308. London: W. H. Allen & Co., 1890.
- "On the Magical Elements in *Chaucer's Squire's Tale*, with Analogues." Appended to *John Lane's Continuation of Chaucer's "Squire's Tale"*, ed. F. J. Furnivall for the Chaucer Society. 263–476. London: K. Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co., 1888, 1890. (A revised edition, unpublished, with Clouston's manuscript notes and letters to Alfred Nutt, is kept in the library of The Folklore Society.)
- "Notes on the Folk-lore of the Raven and the Owl." In *Birds of Omen in Shetland (Inaugural Address to the Viking Club, London, October 13, 1892)*, by Jessie M. E. Saxby. Privately Printed. 1893. Reprinted New York: AMS Press, 1982.

Book Reviews

- The Mesnevi*, by James W. Redhouse. *The Glasgow Herald* (25 April 1881): 9.
- "Two Indian Story Books" (*Folk-Tales of Kashmír* by the Revd J. Hinton Knowles and *Folklore in Southern India* by Pandit S. M. Natésa Sástrí). *The Academy* No. 834 (28 April 1888): 285–6.
- The Handbook of Folk-lore*, ed. George Laurence Gomme. *Notes and Queries* 7th Series, X (13 December 1890): 479–80.
- The Science of Fairy Tales*, by E. S. Hartland. *Glasgow Evening Times* (21 March 1891): 2.

Notes, Comments and Queries

- (1) Items appearing over the initials W. A. C. are assumed to be by W. A. Clouston. The first item has "Dunfermline" as the author's place of residence and all but two of the remainder have "Glasgow".
- "Roll Sin Like a Sweet Morsel Under the Tongue." *Notes and Queries* 4th series, XII (1873): (6 September) 188.
- "Shelley's 'Cenci'." *Notes and Queries* 4th series, XII (1873): (15 November) 395.
- "Sir David Lindsay of the Mount." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (7 February) 108.
- "Poetical Resemblances." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (28 February) 164.
- "Extraordinary Birth of Triplets." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (28 March) 249.
- "'Mashing' Tea." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (28 March) 255.
- "Sir Philip Sidney's 'Arcadia'." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (4 April) 269.

- "Sir David Lindsay." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (9 May) 377.
- "Sterne, As a Poet." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (16 May) 388.
- "Extracts From an Old Magazine." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (30 May) 425.
- "Extraordinary Birth of Triplets." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (6 June) 454.
- "Bunyan." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (20 June) 483.
- "Authors Wanted." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, I (1874): (20 June) 488.
- "Living One's Life Over Again'." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (4 July) 4.
- "Curious Treasonable Letter." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (4 July) 6.
- "Cowper: Trooper." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (4 July) 16.
- "The Latest Irish Bull." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (11 July) 25.
- "Byron: Wycherley, & c." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (11 July) 31.
- "Hudibras." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (11 July) 35.
- "Byron's 'Siege of Corinth'." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (18 July) 50-51.
- "The Sword Wearing Out the Scabbard." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874) (8 August): 109.
- "Alderman Sir William Stames." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (15 August) 124-5.
- "Lord Howe's Great Naval Victory." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (22 August) 146.
- "Walker's 'Pronouncing Dictionary'." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874) (26 September): 252-3.
- "Montaign's 'Essays'." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (3 October) 276.
- "The Scottish Addison." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (24 October) 325-6.
- "Wanted, a Great 'Teetotal' Poet." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (7 November) 366.
- "Parallel Passages." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, II (1874): (12 December) 464.
- "American Reprints: English Reprisals." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, III (1875) (27 February): 178.
- "Foote 'the English Aristophanes': Béranger 'the French Burns'." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, III (1875): (20 March) 232-3.
- "Rev. Dr. Phanael Bacon." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, III (1875): (1 May) 343-4.

(2) Items appearing over the name "W. A. Clouston".

- "Charles Wesley's and Sir W. Jones's 'Lines on an Infant'." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, XI (1879): (31 May) 430-31.
- "The Parson of Calemberg." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, XII (1879): (5 July) 7.
- "Odd Metrical English Versions of the Psalms." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, XII (1879): (19 July) 43.
- "Another Old English Jest of Asiatic Origin." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, XII (1879): (23 August) 145.
- "Sindbad and Ulysses." *Notes and Queries* 5th series, XII (1879): (20 September) 231.

- "When Were Trousers First Worn in England?" *Notes and Queries* 5th series, XII (1879): (8 November) 365–6.
- "Curious Epitaphs." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, I (1880): (7 February) 121.
- "Funeral Eccentricities." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, I (1880): (13 March) 210–11.
- "Woman's Tongue." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, I (1880): (3 April) 272.
- "The Rank is but the Guinea's Stamp'." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, I (1880): (24 April) 344.
- "Parallel Passages, Imitations, &c." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, I (1880): (15 May) 391–2.
- "A History of the Seven Wise Masters'." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, V (1882): (6 May) 354.
- "The Law of Gravitation" *Notes and Queries* 6th series, VI (1882): (26 August) 163–4.
- "Parallel Passages." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, VI (1882): (7 October) 282–3.
- "The Seven Wise Masters' & 'The Fables of Bidpai'." *Notes and Queries* 6th series, XII (1885): (10 October) 281–2.
- "The Book of the Thousand Nights and a Night'." *The Academy* No. 770 (5 February 1887): 94.
- "Fate of Great Asiatic Architects." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, IV (1887): (20 August) 141–2, and (15 October) 304–5.
- "The Fate of Great Asiatic Architects." *The American Architect and Building News* XXII, no. 612 (17 September 1887): 136.
- "William Tell and the Apple." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, IV (1887): (24 September) 241–2.
- "Aucassin and Nicolette'." *The Academy* No. 823 (11 February 1888) 98, and No. 831 (7 April 1888): 242.
- "The Legend Of The Oldest Animals." *The Academy* No. 860 (27 October 1888): 274.
- "Muslim Pictures." *The Academy* No. 868 (22 December 1888): 405.
- "Aladdin's Wonderful Lamp." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, VII (1889): (5 January) 1–2.
- "English Canting Songs." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, VII (1889): (9 February) 104.
- "Drinking the Sea Dry." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, VII (1889): (16 March) 201–2.
- "Gipsy Versions of the Story of the Milkmaid and her Pot of Milk." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, VIII (1889): (21 September) 221–2.
- "Story of the Clever Deceiver." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, VIII (1889): (5 October) 261–2.
- "The Magical Conflict." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, IX (1890): (8 February) 101–2.
- "The Poison Maid." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, IX (1890): (15 March) 202.
- "Chaucer's Story of 'The Mad Cow'." *The Academy* No. 937 (19 April 1890): 269–70.
- "Senegambian Folk-lore: Sorcery." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, IX (1890): (24 May) 401–2.
- "Parallel Passages from European and Asiatic Writers." *Asiatic Quarterly Review* 10, no. 19 (July 1890): 201.

- "Symbolism of the Colour Green." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, X (1890): (23 August) 141-3.
- "The 'Pound of Flesh' in the 'Merchant of Venice'." *The Academy* No. 958 (13 September 1890): 224.
- "'Arabian Poetry for English Readers'." *The Academy* No. 960 (27 September 1890): 274-5.
- "The Divining Rod." *Glasgow Evening Times* (3 November 1890): 2.
- "The Westmorland Tale of 'T'Butcher an' his Cofe'." *Westmorland Gazette* (8 November 1890): 2.
- "'Little Red Riding Hood'." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, X (1890): (29 November) 421-2.
- "The Treasury of King Rhampsinitus" *The Academy* No. 969 (29 November 1890): 506-7.
- "Salt Detested by Demons and Sorcerers." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, X (1890): (20 December) 481-2.
- "French Version of the 'Pied Piper of Hamelin'." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, X (1890): (27 December) 501-2.
- "A 'Barlaam and Joasaph' Parable in the 'Mahabharata'." *The Athenaeum* No. 3302 (7 February 1891): 186-7.
- "Persian Analogue of One of Aesop's Fables." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, XI (1891): (14 March) 202.
- "Story of the Girl who Plucked out her own Eyes." *Folk-Lore* 2 (1891): 129-30.
- "Sancho Panza and the False Debtor" *Notes and Queries* 7th series, XI (1891): (11 April) 281-2.
- "The Fountain of Job." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, XI (1891): (16 May) 381.
- "Stray Folk-Lore Notes." *Notes and Queries* 7th series, XI (1891): (30 May) 421-2.
- "Old Nick and the 'Foul Pipe'." *Notes and Queries* 8th series, II (1892): (5 November) 361-2.
- "Drinking the Moon." *Folk-Lore* 4 (1893): 124.
- "Sorcery: Melting Wax Images of Intended Victims" *Folk-Lore* 4 (1893): 256.
- "Smelling the Head in Token of Affection" *Folk-Lore* 4 (1893): 256-7.
- "'The Barrin' o' the Door'." *The Athenaeum* No. 3412 (18 March 1893): 346-7.
- "'Hieroglyphic' Bibles." *Notes and Queries* 8th series, IV (1893): (5 August) 103-4.
- "Authors of Hymns Wanted." *Notes and Queries* 8th series, IV (1893): (2 September) 187.

Miscellaneous

- Letter from W. A. Clouston to F. J. Furnivall. British Library. B.4098, 1888.
- Thirteen letters from W. A. Clouston to Ernest A. Axon (1868-1947) between 1880 and 1885. In the Axon Papers held at John Rylands Library, Manchester University.
- Letters from W. A. Clouston to William Blackwood & Sons between 1885 and 1894. In the Blackwood Papers held at the National Library of Scotland. MSS 4468-4612.
- Letters W. A. Clouston to and from Bertram Dobell, Bookseller, between 1882 and 1890. Oxford, Bodleian Library (MS. Dobell c. 7, fols. 146-59).

Articles (“Firdausi”, “Forty”, “Háfiz”, “Jest-books”, “Jesters”, “Melusine”) that appeared in *Chambers’s Encyclopaedia—New Edition* 1888/92.

Hieroglyphic Bibles, their Origin and History, etc. (Prospectus). Glasgow: David Bryce & Sons, 1893.

Abstract of “Norse Tales and their Eastern Analogues.” (Read before the Viking Club, 17 November 1892, previously published in *Orkney Herald* (see ‘Articles’). In *Saga-Book of the Viking Club*. vol. I. Proceedings, 1892–96 London: Printed privately. 6–9, 1897.

Acknowledgements

The author wishes to thank the following for their help in finding biographical and bibliographical details: Caroline Oates, The Folklore Society Library, London; Anne Escott, Local Studies, and Richard Youngs, Special Collections, The Mitchell Library, Glasgow; Peter W. Asplin, Special Collections, Glasgow University Library; Alison Fraser, Principal Archivist, The Orkney Library, Kirkwall; K. J. Dunn, Department of Manuscripts, The National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh; Natalie Bushe, Research Librarian, Newsquest (*Herald and Times*) Ltd; Michael Barnes, The Viking Club, London; Fiona Downie, Glasgow & West of Scotland Family History Society; Jonathan Harrison, St John’s College Library, Cambridge.

Notes

- [1] Dorson’s major treatment of Clouston is in his *The British Folklorists* (Dorson 1968a, 257–65), where he is firmly in the “Great Team.” Nevertheless, although Clouston had been in Dorson’s “Team” since 1951. when unaccountably he was “English” and “resided in Edinburgh” (Dorson 1951, 1 and 4), and appeared in it again in 1961 (Dorson 1961, 17), by 1968, despite his honoured place in *The British Folklorists*, his position on the “Team” had already become tenuous (Dorson 1968b, 1–23). By 1976 Clouston had definitely been relegated (Dorson 1976, 109), possibly under pressure from the then new wave of American folklorists (e.g. Goldstein, Ben-Amos and Abrahams), who would probably have regarded Clouston’s labours as pointless comparativism; thereafter the “Team” was recognised as having only five members (Dorson 1978, 786; 1980, 145–56).
- [2] The “Obituary” for William A. Clouston appears in the list of works by Edwin Sidney Hartland based on his own record published in *Folklore* 37 (1926): 185. See also Dorson (1968a, 204).
- [3] National Library of Scotland, MS 4482. In these letters Clouston pressed for a deal involving a sale of copyright, one-half of the cash to be paid to him immediately and the remainder to be paid six months later rather than a lump sum on publication, plus five shillings per copy for every copy in excess of six hundred sold. At the end of six months he was again in financial straits and repeatedly wrote for his money, finally (10 November 1886) resorting to a telegram saying he must have a cheque that night.
- [4] The only book that I am aware of that has attempted to do something similar is the delightful *Thrice Told Tales. Folktales from Three Continents* edited by Kenneth S. Goldstein and Dan Ben-Amos (Goldstein and Ben-Amos 1970). This work blends popular and scholarly approaches in comparing three versions of four tale types (Cinderella [Types 520 and 510A]; The Tarbaby and the Rabbit [Type 175]; The Magician and His Pupil [Type 325]; Quest for a Vanished Princess [Type 310A]), one each from Europe, Asia and Africa. But the editors’

claim to be unique and their failure to even mention Clouston's *Popular Tales and Fictions* is justified only on the basis of their including "complete" texts and their emphasis on differences rather than similarities in the versions from each tradition area.

- [5] In 1892 Clouston politely chides Jacobs in return: "Mr. Jacobs, ... In his charming book, *Celtic Fairy Tales*, remarks that 'a similar story is found in *some versions* of "The Forty Vazirs" and in the "Turkish Tales";' as if these were the names of different works: as I have already stated (pp. 191, 192), the *Contes Turcs* of Petis de la Croix are a partial French rendering of the Turkish *Qırq Vazır*" (Clouston 1892, 556).
- [6] Unfortunately an otherwise excellent and long-required new edition is marred by a failure to repaginate properly and the introduction of several misprints not in the original edition, while failing to correct a misprint ("Owyll" instead of *Pwyll*": see Clouston 1887, vol. I, 429; Goldberg 2002, 219) pointed out by a reviewer in 1887 in anticipation of a second edition! (*The Athenaeum* 1887, 542).

References Cited

- Aarne, Antti, and Stith Thompson. *The Types of the Folktale*. A Classification and bibliography. 2nd revision. F.F. Communications, no. 184. Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica, 1961; 1973.
- A Supplement to Allibone's Critical Dictionary of English Literature and British and American Writers*, ed. John Foster Kirk. Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott, 1891. Reprinted 1965.
- Athenaeum*, *The*. Anonymous review of *Popular Tales and Fictions: their Migrations and Transformations*, by W. A. Clouston. No. 3104, 541–2. Blackwood & Sons, 23 April 1887.
- Bolte, J., and G. Polivka. *Anmerkungen zu den Kinder- und Hausmärchen der Brüder Grimm*. 5 vols. Leipzig: Dieterich's Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1913–32 .
- Census for Scotland*. General Register Office for Scotland, Edinburgh, 1861, 1871, 1881, 1891.
- Clouston, W. A. *Popular Tales and Fictions, their migrations and transformations*. 2 vols. Edinburgh and London: William Blackwood and Sons, 1887. New Edition, ed. and introduction by Christine Goldberg. Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO, 2002.
- Clouston, W. A. "Uncle Remus' and Some European Popular Tales &c." *Notes and Queries*. 7th series, X. 1890 (26 July): 61–2; (13 September): 201–2; (4 October): 263–4; (18 October): 301–2; (8 November): 363–4.
- Clouston, W. A. Review of *The Science of Fairy Tales* by E. S. Hartland. *Glasgow Evening Times* (21 March 1891): 2.
- Clouston, W. A. "On the Magical Elements in *Chaucer's Squire's Tale*, with Analogues." Appended to *John Lane's Continuation of Chaucer's "Squire's Tale"*, ed. F. J. Furnivall for the Chaucer Society. 263–476. London: K. Paul, Trench, Trübner & Co., 1888, 1890. (A revised edition, unpublished, with Clouston's manuscript notes and letters to Alfred Nutt dated 11 and 15 December 1891, is kept in the library of The Folklore Society.)
- Clouston, W. A. "The Three Precepts: a Norse Variant." *Folk-Lore* 3 (1892): 556–8.
- Clouston, W. A. "The Works of Sir William Jones." *The Bookworm* 6 (1893): 19–22
- Cocchiara, Giuseppe. *The History of Folklore in Europe*. Philadelphia: Institute for the Study of Human Issues, 1971.
- Dorson, Richard M. "The Great Team of English Folklorists." *Journal of American Folklore* 64 (1951): 1–10.
- Dorson, Richard M. "The Eclipse of Solar Mythology." *Journal of American Folklore* 68 (1955): 393–416.
- Dorson, Richard M. "Folklore Studies in England." In *Folklore Research around the World: A North*

- American Point of View*, ed. Richard M. Dorson. 16–26. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1961.
- Dorson, Richard M. *The British Folklorists*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1968a.
- Dorson, Richard M. "Great Team of English Folklorists," *Louisiana Folklore Miscellany* 11 (1968b): 1–23.
- Dorson, Richard M. *Folklore and Fakelore*, Harvard: Harvard University Press, 1976.
- Dorson, Richard M. "The Founders of British folklore." *Times Literary Supplement* No. 3980 (14 July 1978): 786–7.
- Dorson, Richard M. "The Reception of *The British Folklorists*, or, Have You Read 'The Great Team'?" In *Folklore Studies in Honour of Herbert Halpert*, ed. Kenneth S. Goldstein and Neil V. Rosenberg. 145–56. St John's: Memorial University of Newfoundland, 1980.
- Dundes, Alan. *International Folkloristics*. Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield, 1999.
- Folklore Fellows Communications*. Folklore Monograph Series. Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica, 1910–.
- Goldberg, Christine, ed. *Popular Tales and Fictions* by W. A. Clouston. Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO, 2002.
- Goldstein, Kenneth S. and Don Ben-Amos, eds. *Thrice Told Tales: Folktales from Three Continents*. Lock Haven, Pa: Hammermill Paper Co., 1970.
- Hartland, Edwin Sidney. "Obituary. W. A. Clouston." *Folk-Lore* 8 (1897): 94.
- Jacobs, Joseph, ed. *The Earliest English Version of the Fables of Bidpai*. London: David Nutt, 1888.
- Lang, Andrew. "Cinderella and the Diffusion of Tales." *Folk-Lore* 4, no. 4 (1893): 413–32.
- Nutt, Alfred. Letters to, regarding *On The Magical Elements in Chaucer's Squire's Tale* (see Clouston 1891).
- Ralston, W. R. S. Review of *Popular Tales and Fictions* by W. A. Clouston. *The Academy*, No. 787 (1887): 388
- Kurt Ranke, ed. *Enzyklopädie des Märchens*. vols 1–4. Berlin and New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1977–84; ed. Rolf W. Brednich. vols 5–. 1987–.
- Thompson, Stith. *Motif-Index of Folk Literature*. 6 vols. Copenhagen: Rosenkilde and Bagger, 1955–8.
- Thompson, Stith. *The Folktale*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1977 (1946).
- Utle, Francis Lee. "Arthurian Romance and International Folktale Method." *Romance Philology* 17, no. 3 (1964): 596–607.
- Utle, Francis Lee. Introduction and Reference Notes to *Once Upon a Time* by Max Lüthi. 1–20; 161–70. Bloomington and London: Indiana University Press, 1976.
- Utle, Francis Lee. "The Folktale: Life History vs. Structuralism." In *Varia Folklorica*, ed. Alan Dundes. 1–22. The Hague: Mouton, 1978.

Biographical Note

Gareth Whittaker qualified as a chartered accountant in 1965 and worked overseas for a number of years. He subsequently studied philosophy at Lancaster and Calgary universities, took teacher training in 1988 and is a teacher of mathematics since 1990. His main folklore interests include folktales, children's games and gestures.